

Of Sodomites, Effeminate, Hermaphrodites, and Androgynes

This book is composed of two parts. The first consists of four chapters treating basic questions in the historical study of sex and gender. Each begins with the ancient world and moves through the early middle ages. Chapter one emphasizes that all centuries had a varied language of sex. In showing there was no single understanding of gender and power relationships, the second chapter argues that the story of gender should encompass more than the history of power. Of special interest is the means by which “sex” was put into words, passed from inarticulateness to articulateness. Central is the vocabulary of the penitentials and canon law, studied in chapter three. This leads in the following chapter to examination of the question of the forms of sexual imagination that existed in the early middle ages. Here and elsewhere, the argument is illustrated by examination of the literature, art, and sculpture of the period.

Part two turns to Peter Damian, especially his Epistle 31, the so-called Book of Gomorrah. Chapter by chapter, the principle themes of this work are analyzed, along with such questions as whether Damian represents the onset of “the persecuting society.” The chapters study Damian’s understanding of nature and sins against nature. Chapter eight, on *luxuria*, contains numerous illustrations from Romanesque sculpture, and the final chapter explores Damian’s sense of the relation between demonic incitement, lust, free will, and effeminacy, and his notion that sodomy might be “situational.”

STUDIES AND TEXTS 176

Of Sodomites, Effeminates,
Hermaphrodites, and Androgynes

Sodomy in the Age of Peter Damian

GLENN W. OLSEN



PONTIFICAL INSTITUTE OF MEDIAEVAL STUDIES

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Olsen, Glenn W. (Glenn Warren), 1938–

Of sodomites, effeminate, hermaphrodites, and androgynes : sodomy in the age of Peter Damian / Glenn W. Olsen.

(Studies and texts, ISSN 0082-5328 ; 176)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-88844-176-8

1. Sex – History – To 1500. 2. Sex role – History – To 1500. 3. Peter Damian, Saint, 1007?-1072. Liber Gomorrhianus. English. 4. Sodomy – History of doctrines – Middle Ages, 600-1500. I. Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies II. Title. III. Series: Studies and texts (Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies) 176

HQ12.O47 2011

306.709

C2011-904924-4

© 2011

Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies

59 Queen's Park Crescent East

Toronto, Ontario, Canada M5S 2C4

www.pims.ca

MANUFACTURED IN CANADA

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	vii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xi
<i>Plates</i>	following page xiv
INTRODUCTION	I
PART ONE Problems and Definitions	
CHAPTER ONE Naming Sodomy	13
CHAPTER TWO Gender and Power	47
CHAPTER THREE Terms of Endearment	99
CHAPTER FOUR The Sexual Subject	132
PART TWO Peter Damian	
CHAPTER FIVE Peter Damian's Letter 31 and Eleventh-Century Reform	203
CHAPTER SIX Sodomy in Damian's Letter 31	263
CHAPTER SEVEN Nature and Sins Against Nature in Damian's Letter 31	290
CHAPTER EIGHT <i>Luxuria</i> , the Devil's Work	329
CHAPTER NINE 'The Devil, You Say': Lust, Free Will, and Effeminacy in Peter Damian's Letter 31	387
<i>Afterword</i>	420
<i>Bibliography</i>	425
<i>Index</i>	505

List of Illustrations

- FIGURE 1: Tayac (Aquitaine), erotic interlace, likely anal intercourse, involving two naked men on an apse modillion, late eleventh or twelfth century.
- FIGURE 2: San Pedro de Cervatos (Cantabria), erotically interlaced nude man and woman peering down from apse canecillo, twelfth century.
- FIGURE 3: San Juan Bautista, Villanueva de la Nie (Cantabria), probable portrayal on canecillo of male-male anal intercourse, twelfth or early thirteenth century.
- FIGURE 4: Monprimblanc (Gironde, Aquitaine), modillion with one bearded man apparently attempting anal intercourse on another a little before 1100.
- FIGURE 5: Monprimblanc (Gironde, Aquitaine), modillion with a man who seems to be inviting anal coitus a little before 1100.
- FIGURE 6: San Martin de Mondoñedo, outside Foz (Lugo, Galicia), man baring his anus on a canecillo next to a couple in coitus, twelfth century.
- FIGURE 7: Notre-Dame-du-Port, Clermont-Ferrand (Auvergne), capital of about 1100 apparently recalling Ganymede story.
- FIGURE 8: Colegiata at Santillana del Mar (Cantabria), presentation of pederasty on canecillo now in the cloister, late twelfth century.
- FIGURE 9: Colegiata at Santillana del Mar (Cantabria), presentation of pederasty on canecillo now in the cloister, late twelfth century.
- FIGURE 10: Mozat (Mozac), near Clermont-Ferrand (Auvergne), one of two nude boys or young men, with knee on ground, on nave capital of about 1080.
- FIGURE 11: Mozat (Mozac), near Clermont-Ferrand (Auvergne), nave capital (on left) showing two nude but caped youths riding two goats, of about 1080 (griffion on right capital).
- FIGURE 12: Mozat (Mozac), near Clermont-Ferrand (Auvergne), nave capital with centaur, of about 1080.
- FIGURE 13: Mozat (Mozac), near Clermont-Ferrand (Auvergne), on left, nave capital with centaurs, on right, nave capital with nude adolescent Victories, about 1080.

FIGURE 14: Mozat (Mozac), near Clermont-Ferrand (Auvergne), displaced capital on display at back of church with Telamons on each of its four corners, about 1080.

FIGURE 15: Saint-Julien, Brioude (Auvergne), capital with fully exposed genitals.

FIGURE 16: Saint Marcellinus, Chanteuges, near Clermont-Ferrand (Auvergne), portrayal of nude men among foliage.

FIGURE 17: Saint-Pierre, Chauvigny (Vienne), Satan and his devils on a repainted figured capital of about 1080–1120.

FIGURE 18: Saint-Trophime, Arles (Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur), right side of the main portal, Satan sitting naked, one of the damned upside-down under each arm, and a *luxuria* figure, perched on or riding a dragon, sitting with the back of her head against Satan's crotch, about 1190.

FIGURE 19: Tejada (Burgos, Castilla-León), male and female apse exhibitionism, twelfth century.

FIGURE 20: San Pedro de Villanueva near Cangas de Onis (Asturias), twelfth-century masturbating monkey.

FIGURE 21: Conques (Languedoc-Roussillon) tympanum of the West portal, about 1135.

FIGURE 22: Seo de Urgell (La Seu d'Urgell) (Lleida, Catalonia), nereid on an exterior twelfth-century capital beside north porch with serpents gnawing at her breasts.

FIGURE 23: Pecharromán (Segovia), twelfth-century apse canecillo on which a snake is placed under a man carrying a nude woman over his shoulder, her legs splayed open.

FIGURE 24: San Pedro de Villanueva near Cangas de Onis (Asturias), one of restored twelfth-century apse canecillos with ithyphallic masturbating bird figures.

FIGURE 25: San Pedro de Villanueva near Cangas de Onis (Asturias), one of restored twelfth-century apse canecillos with masturbating bird figures ("before" on left, "after" on right).

FIGURE 26: San Pedro de Villanueva near Cangas de Onis (Asturias), restored twelfth-century apse canecillo with possible portrayal of male same-sex love.

FIGURE 27: San Pedro de Abrisketa, Arrigorriaga (Vizcaya, País Vasco), south of Bilbao, naked couple in the act of coitus on the exterior wall of an eleventh-century hermitage.

FIGURE 28: San Miguel, Fuentidueña (Segovia), seated coital couple on twelfth-century nave canecillo who seem to be enjoying themselves at our expense, both sticking out their tongues at us.

- FIGURE 29: Santa María (Marína) de Yermo (Cantabria), twelfth-century portrayal of seated intercourse, faces in grimaces.
- FIGURE 30: San Isidro, León (Castilla-León), aisle face of twelfth-century nave capital showing nude acrobats, one of which, an exhibitionist woman with a rope around her neck, stands on the chests of two men.
- FIGURE 31: Santa Maria la Real, Sangüesa (Navarra), woman on upper-left of the porch being attacked by a huge serpent with a semi-human face, about 1170.
- FIGURE 32: Sant Pere de Galligans, Girona (Catalonia), nereid or siren exposing herself revealing an eye/vagina on the inside of each thigh, on twelfth-century capital from the cloister.
- FIGURE 33: Girona (Catalonia), twelfth-century panel in the cathedral cloister apparently built around the theme of lust, depicting three men in a cauldron signifying hell, a devil on either side of the cauldron sodomizing a man, and two flanking luxury figures.
- FIGURE 34: Santa María de la Oliva, Villaviciosa (Asturias), porch showing the punishment of an upside-down “luxurious” man, whose genitals are being devoured by a wild boar.
- FIGURE 35: Sta. Maria de L’Estany (Catalonia), “tails” of two lions in a monster’s mouth, about 1124–33.
- FIGURE 36: Sta. Maria de los Angeles, San Vicente de la Bárquera (Cantabria), thirteenth-century monastic or clerical exhibitionist.
- FIGURE 37: Colegiata at Santillana del Mar (Cantabria), late twelfth century.
- FIGURE 38: Santa Marta del Cerro (Segovia), parallel twelfth-century canecillos, one a male with a very long, erect, phallus, presumably the result of the other, a female exhibitionist.
- FIGURE 39: Colegiata at Santillana del Mar (Cantabria), woman presumably masturbating man, late twelfth -century.
- FIGURE 40: Barahona de Fresno (Segovia), auto-fellatio.
- FIGURE 41: Anzy-le-Duc (Burgundy), man doubled from the waist up with two trunks and heads, twelfth century (there seems to be some patching in the genital area, but this does not seem to be a portrayal of an erection).
- FIGURE 42: San Cipriano, Bolmir (Cantabria), man (canecillo in center) in coitus with a bird (?), twelfth century.
- FIGURE 43: San Cipriano, Bolmir (Cantabria), twelfth-century bas relief, probably of animals playing.
- FIGURE 44: St. Martín de Elines (Cantabria), twelfth-century canecillo of monkey engaged in asphyxiophilia.

FIGURE 45: Santos Cosme y Damián, Bárcena de Pie de Concha (Cantabria), possible twelfth-century portrayal of man choking himself with his right hand as he masturbates with his left.

FIGURE 46: St-Genès, Châteaumeillant (Cher, Centre), twelfth-century capital of male-male love with two peasants embracing and kissing, one peasant apparently holding his erect penis with his left hand as it emerges from the folds of his clothing, with inscription “hac rusticani mixti.”

FIGURE 47: St. Lazare, Autun (Saône-et-Loire, Burgundy), thirteenth-century “mooning” figure.

FIGURE 48: San Martín de Elines (Cantabria), twelfth-century canecillo of disputed interpretation (Cain and Abel; youths embracing; or youths fighting, symbolizing anger).

FIGURE 49: St. Pierre, Marestry, entwined men on a twelfth-century window capital.

FIGURE 50: Ste. Marie, Souillac (Lot, Midi-Pyrénées), bottom couple of right face of *trumeau* from about 1135, on which three couples wrestle, each a youth and a grown man.

FIGURE 51: Moarves de Ojeda (Palencia, Castilla-León), late twelfth- or early thirteenth-century sculpture of two seated young men holding hands and shoulders touching on a capital of the left side of the porch.

Abbreviations

AB	<i>The Art Bulletin</i>
ABR	<i>The American Benedictine Review</i>
ACW	Ancient Christian Writers
AFK	<i>Archiv für Kulturgeschichte</i>
AES	<i>Anuario de Estudios Medievales</i>
AESC	<i>Annales; économies, sociétés, civilisations</i>
AFK	<i>Archiv für Kulturgeschichte</i>
AHDE	<i>Anuario de Historia del Derecho español</i>
AHR	<i>The American Historical Review</i>
AKKR	<i>Archiv für katholisches Kirchenrecht</i>
AS	<i>Acta Sanctorum</i> , ed. Socii Bollandiani, 69 vols. (Paris 1863–1940)
AHR	<i>The American Historical Review</i>
AM	<i>Arte Medievale</i>
ANF	The Ante-Nicene Fathers
ATR	<i>Anglican Theological Review</i>
CCCM	Corpus Christianorum. Continuatio Mediaevalis
CCM	<i>Cahiers de Civilisation Médiévale Xe-XIIe Siècles</i>
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum. Series Latina
CH	<i>Church History</i>
CHR	<i>The Catholic Historical Review</i>
CIH	<i>Corpus Iuris Hibernici</i>
CR	<i>Chaucer Review</i>
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
CSQ	<i>Cistercian Studies Quarterly</i>
CSSR	<i>The Catholic Social Science Review</i>
DA	<i>Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters</i>
DMA	<i>Dictionary of the Middle Ages</i> (New York 1982–)
DSAMDH	<i>Dictionnaire de spiritualité ascétique et mystique, doctrine et histoire</i> (Paris 1932–)

EEC	<i>Encyclopedia of the Early Church</i> , ed. Angelo Di Berardino, trans. Adrian Walford, with a foreword and bibliographic amendments by W. H. C. Frend, 2 vols. (New York 1992).
EGR	<i>European Gay Review</i>
EHR	<i>English Historical Review</i>
EME	<i>Early Medieval Europe</i>
FCSQ	<i>Fellowship of Catholic Scholars Quarterly</i>
FOC	Fathers of the Church
FOCMC	Fathers of the Church, Mediaeval Continuation
FQI	<i>Fides Quaerens Intellectum</i>
FT	<i>First Things</i>
GCS	Die Griechischen Christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten Jahrhunderte
GH	<i>Gender and History</i>
GLQ	<i>GLQ: A Journal of Lesbian and Gay Studies</i>
HGLR	<i>Harvard Gay and Lesbian Review</i>
HJ	<i>Heythrop Journal</i>
HOR	<i>History of Religions</i>
HPLS	<i>History and Philosophy of the Life Sciences</i>
HT	<i>History and Theory</i>
HTR	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
IC	<i>Ius Commune</i>
ITQ	<i>Irish Theological Quarterly</i>
JBS	<i>Journal of British Studies</i>
JECS	<i>Journal of Early Christian Studies</i>
JEH	<i>Journal of Ecclesiastical History</i>
JH	<i>The Journal of Homosexuality</i>
JHS	<i>Journal of the History of Sexuality</i>
JoHS	<i>The Journal of the Historical Society</i>
JMEMS	<i>Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies</i>
JMH	<i>Journal of Medieval History</i>
JML	<i>The Journal of Medieval Latin</i>
JMoH	<i>The Journal of Modern History</i>
JOB	<i>Jahrbuch der Österreichischen Byzantinistik</i>
JoHS	<i>The Journal of the Historical Society</i>
JRE	<i>The Journal of Religious Ethics</i>
JRH	<i>Journal of Religious History</i>
JRS	<i>Journal of Roman Studies</i>
JTS	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>

<i>JWH</i>	<i>Journal of Women's History</i>
<i>Logos</i>	<i>Logos: A Journal of Catholic Thought and Culture</i>
<i>LQ</i>	<i>Linacre Quarterly</i>
<i>MC</i>	<i>Miscelánea Comillas</i>
<i>MedS</i>	<i>Mediterranean Studies</i>
<i>MGH</i>	<i>Monumenta Germaniae Historica</i>
	AA <i>Auctores Antiquissimi</i>
<i>MH</i>	<i>Medievalia et Humanistica: Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Culture</i>
<i>MIC</i>	<i>Monumenta iuris canonici</i>
<i>Micrologus</i>	<i>Micrologus: Natura, scienze e società medievali</i>
<i>MH</i>	<i>Medievalia et Humanistica: Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Culture</i>
<i>MJ</i>	<i>Mittellateinisches Jahrbuch</i>
<i>MR</i>	<i>The Maghreb Review</i>
<i>MS</i>	<i>Mediaeval Studies</i>
<i>NOR</i>	<i>New Oxford Review</i>
<i>NPNF</i>	<i>The Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church</i>
<i>NR</i>	<i>The New Republic</i>
<i>NY</i>	<i>The New Yorker</i>
<i>NYRB</i>	<i>The New York Review of Books</i>
<i>NYT</i>	<i>The New York Times</i>
<i>OCD</i>	<i>The Oxford Classical Dictionary</i> , ed. Simon Hornblower and Antony Spawforth, 3rd ed. (New York 1996).
<i>PACPA</i>	<i>Proceedings of the American Catholic Philosophical Association</i>
<i>PG</i>	<i>Patrologiae cursus completus series Graeca</i>
<i>PL</i>	<i>Patrologiae cursus completus series Latina</i>
<i>PMLA</i>	<i>Proceedings of the Modern Language Association</i>
<i>PP</i>	<i>Past and Present</i>
<i>PQ</i>	<i>Philological Quarterly</i>
<i>PR</i>	<i>Partisan Review</i>
<i>PT</i>	<i>Political Theory</i>
<i>PACPA</i>	<i>Proceedings of the American Catholic Philosophical Association</i>
<i>PMLA</i>	<i>Proceedings of the Modern Language Association</i>
<i>RB</i>	<i>Revue Bénédictine</i>
<i>RBPH</i>	<i>Revue belge de Philologie et d'Histoire</i>
<i>RM</i>	<i>Revue Mabillon</i>
<i>ROM</i>	<i>Review of Metaphysics</i>
<i>RQ</i>	<i>Romance Quarterly</i>

<i>RR</i>	<i>The Romanic Review</i>
<i>RSCI</i>	<i>Rivista di Storia della Chiesa in Italia</i>
<i>RSR</i>	<i>Religious Studies Review</i>
<i>RuR</i>	<i>The Russian Review</i>
<i>SC</i>	<i>Sources chrétiennes</i>
<i>SFR</i>	<i>Stanford French Review</i>
<i>SG</i>	<i>Studi Gregoriani</i>
<i>SH</i>	<i>Social History</i>
<i>SLH</i>	<i>Scriptores Latini Hiberniae</i>
<i>SM</i>	<i>Studia Monastica</i>
<i>SMed</i>	<i>Studi Medievali</i>
<i>SP</i>	<i>Studia Patristica</i>
<i>SR</i>	<i>Studies in Religion</i>
<i>SS</i>	<i>Second Spring: An International Journal of Faith and Culture</i>
<i>ST</i>	<i>Studia Theologica</i>
<i>TJT</i>	<i>Toronto Journal of Theology</i>
<i>TLS</i>	<i>Times Literary Supplement</i>
<i>TRHS</i>	<i>Transactions of the Royal Historical Society</i>
<i>TS</i>	<i>Theological Studies</i>
<i>VC</i>	<i>Vigiliae Christianae</i>
<i>WS</i>	<i>Word and Spirit: a monastic review</i>
<i>ZAW</i>	<i>Zeitschrift für die Alttestamentliche Wissenschaft</i>
<i>ZFW</i>	<i>Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte</i>