

*Recusancy and Conformity in Early Modern England*  
*Manuscript and Printed Sources in Translation*

Scholarship of the past few decades has succeeded in questioning the wholly objective status typically attributed to the terms of religious affiliation common in early modern England. This is not to say that expressions such as puritan, Arminian, Calvinist are without meaning. But it is equally clear that religious identities have to be reconstructed by interrogating what those terms meant for contemporaries, and by analyzing how their attitudes toward particular styles of liturgy, worship, and conformity to the law that governed the national Church shaped their own awareness of religious identity.

This proved especially the case during the reign of Elizabeth I, when what it meant to be a Catholic was complicated by the question of individual compliance with the statute law, the act of uniformity of 1559 and subsequent statutes, notably in 1581 and 1587. One of the best sources for our understanding of the issue is the casuistical literature by Catholic polemicists, who argued with each other about how far conformity to the established Church could be excused, legitimated, and even recommended, in particular as a response to government claims that, at some level, conformity signified no more than obedience to secular temporal authority. This volume seeks to make available in translation to students and scholars in early modern studies the principal texts on conformity and recusancy in the Elizabethan Church.

This collection will be an invaluable resource for future scholars and students of post-Reformation Catholicism in the British Isles. It makes accessible in an excellent scholarly edition key documents associated with the contentious question of Catholic conformity in Elizabethan and early Jacobean England and Scotland. Bringing together published and unpublished material that has hitherto been scattered in a variety of libraries and archives, the volume combines careful transcription of material in its original languages with clear English translations. Accompanied by a helpful introduction, *Recusancy and Conformity in Early Modern England* sheds revealing new light on the struggle to reconcile religious and political loyalty and advances our knowledge of how dilemmas of conscience were negotiated and resolved in post-Reformation Europe. It will surely become a standard point of reference in the field.

— ALEXANDRA WALSHAM, *University of Exeter*

CATHOLIC AND RECUSANT TEXTS OF  
THE LATE MEDIEVAL  
& EARLY MODERN PERIODS

Edited by

T.S. FREEMAN, *University of Sheffield*  
ANN M. HUTCHISON, *York University and PIMS*  
ALISON SHELL, *University of Durham*

The Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies acknowledges  
the generous assistance of JOSEPH and CLAUDINE POPE  
in the publication of Catholic and Recusant Texts  
of the Late Medieval and Early Modern Periods.

PIMS

STUDIES AND TEXTS 170

*Recusancy and Conformity  
in Early Modern England*

*Manuscript and Printed Sources in Translation*

*Edited by*

GINEVRA CROSIGNANI, THOMAS M. MCCOOG,

*and* MICHAEL QUESTIER

*with the assistance of Peter Holmes*



PONTIFICAL INSTITUTE OF MEDIAEVAL STUDIES

*Acknowledgement*

We gratefully acknowledge the award of a grant-in-aid by the British Province of the Society of Jesus towards the publication of this volume.

*Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication*

Recusancy and conformity in early modern England : manuscript and printed sources in translation / edited by Ginevra Crosignani, Thomas M. McCoog, and Michael Questier ; with the assistance of Peter Holmes.

(Catholic and recusant texts of the late medieval and early modern periods ; 2)

(Studies and texts, ISSN 0082-5328 ; 170)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-88844-170-6

1. Catholic Church – England – History – 16th century. 2. Church and state – England – History – 16th century. 3. Christianity and politics – England – History – 16th century. 4. England – Church history – 16th century. 5. Great Britain – History – Elizabeth, 1558-1603. I. Crosignani, Ginevra II. McCoog, Thomas M III. Questier, Michael C IV. Holmes, Peter (Peter J.) V. Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies VI. Series: Catholic and recusant texts of the late medieval and early modern periods ; 2 VII. Series: Studies and texts (Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies) ; 170

BX1492.R4I8 2010

282'.4209031

C2010-900106-0

© 2010

Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies

59 Queen's Park Crescent East

Toronto, Ontario, Canada M5S 2C4

[www.pims.ca](http://www.pims.ca)

MANUFACTURED IN CANADA

# Contents

Preface	ix
Abbreviations	xi
Introduction	xiii

## Initial Legislation and the Catholic Dilemma

1	An Act for the Uniformity of Common Prayer and Divine Service in the Church, 1559	I
2	Petition of English Catholics to the Council of Trent [circa June 1562]	I
3	Alvaro de la Quadra, Bishop of Aquila and Spanish ambassador to England, to Francisco Vargas, Spanish ambassador to Rome, London, 7 August 1562	4
4	The Declaration of the Fathers of the Council of Trent [August 1562]	9
5	Opinion of the Roman Inquisition [September 1562]	25
6	Pope Pius IV to Alvaro de Quadra, Rome, 2 October 1562	27

## The Beginnings of Recusancy

7	John Feckenham [8 February 1563]	30
8	Supplication of the English Exiles, Louvain, 8 March 1566	57
9	Laurence Vaux to his friends in Lancashire, 2 November 1566	60
10	Thomas Harding and Nicholas Sander to Giovanni, Cardinal Morone, Louvain, 11 June 1567	64
11	Nicholas Sander, <i>A Treatise of the Images of Christ, and of his Saints: and that it is unlawful to breake them, and lawful to honour them</i> (Louvain, 1567), extract	69
12	Faculties granted to Thomas Harding, Nicholas Sander, and Thomas Peacock, Rome, 14 August 1567	71
13	Giovanni Andrea Caligari to Giovanni Francesco, Cardinal Commendone, Pieve, 6 December 1567	78
14	William Allen to Jean Vendeville, Reims, 16 September 1578, extract	83

### The Excommunication and its Interpretation

15	Pope Pius V, <i>Regnans in Excelsis</i> , Rome, 25 February 1570	86
16	Ad consolationem et instructionem quorundam Catholicorum angustiis constitutorum quaestiones aliquot [before April 1580]	90
17	Cases of Conscience [late 1570s–early 1580s]	100

### The Debate Begins: Conditional Conformity, Recusancy

18	Gregory Martin, <i>A Treatise of Schisme</i> (Douai [verè London], 1578), extract	111
19	[Alban Langdale or William Clitherow] to [Ralph] Sheldon, ca. 1580	116
20	Against Going to Church [1581/1582]	130
21	An act to retain the Queen's Majesty's subjects in their due obedience (23 Eliz. I c. 1), 1581	131
22	"A briefe advertisement howe to answer unto the Statute for not coming to Church both in Law, and Conscience, containing three principall points" [1581–1582]	132
23	Robert Persons and George Blackwell, "Against Going to Churche" [1580]	142
24	Responsum P. Francisci [Toledo] ad casum de aduendis Ecclesiis in Anglia, 14 June 1581	156
25	Refutation of "A comfortable advertisement" [May 1588]	157
26	<i>Relatione del Presente Stato d' Inghilterra cavata da una lettera de li 25. di maggio scritta di Londra, et da un' altra, scritta da una persona di qualità, venuta di fresco d' Inghilterra, data in Anversa alli 27. di Giugno, &amp; altre</i> [Rome, 1590]	243
27	William, Cardinal Allen to Catholics in England, Rome, 12 December 1592	260
28	Henry Garnet's Preface to the Publication of the Tridentine Resolutions [1593]	262
29	Henry Garnet, <i>A treatise of Christian renunciation</i> (n.p., n.d. [England, 1593]), extract.	265

### Intra-Jesuit Debate on the Meaning of Recusancy

30	Henry Garnet to Claudio Acquaviva, London, 11 March 1601	279
31	[Robert Persons] to Henry Garnet, 30 April 1602 [verè 1601]	281
32	Henry Garnet to Robert Persons, 2 June 1601	282

**The Problem of Occasional Conformity in Scotland**

33	Cases of Conscience, 1587	285
34	Robert Abercromby to Claudio Acquaviva and George Duras, n.d. [circa 1601/02]	286
35	Andreas Stenson [ <i>vere</i> William Murdoch] to George Duras, Elgin, 1 July 1602	287
36	Alexander MacQuhirrie to Claudio Acquaviva, England, 1 December 1602	288
37	William Crichton to Claudio Acquaviva, Paris, 4 June 1603	290
38	[Robert Taylor?], "Avvisi," London, 12 July 1603	291
39	Alexander MacQuirrie to Claudio Acquaviva, London, 20 July 1603	292
40	Alexander MacQuirrie to Claudio Acquaviva, London, 24 August 1603	294
41	John Burnet ( <i>vere</i> Alexander MacQuhirrie) to Claudio Acquaviva, London, 18 July 1604	295

**Late Elizabethan/Early Jacobean Cases**

42	"Directions [for Catholics] as to the lawfull manner of answering questions of going to Church," 23 May 1601 [?]	296
43	Henry Garnet, "Treatise of Equivocation," ca. early 1598	298
44	"Utrum vir Catholicus licite possit principem suum haereticum ad haereticorum templa comitari, et in ibi cum eo esse dum Sacra haeretico ritu peraguntur" [1604–1612]	343
45	Thomas Wright, "De adeundis Ecclesiis Protestantium" [1606?]	353
46	[Robert Persons] to [Thomas Wright] [post August 1607]	371
47	Thomas Wright Replies to the "Latin Questions" [1607/early 1608]	387

Bibliography	401
Index	417





## Preface

What began as a small gathering of a few documents illustrative of different aspects of occasional conformity or church popery, developed into this collection. One document seemed to lead to another. Indeed, we could have gathered more, but we resisted the temptation lest a good book be lost in the pursuit of the best book. Many assisted us in our work. We have acknowledged different translators and colleagues who had checked and confirmed manuscript references in the headnote to each document. Here we would like to acknowledge friends and scholars whose support and interest sustained us in our work: Professor Alexandra Walsham, University of Exeter; Professor Peter Davidson, University of Aberdeen; Professor Robert Miola, Loyola University, Maryland; Father Peter Harris, English College, Valladolid; Dr Thomas S. Freeman, Cambridge University; and Dr Mordechai Feingold and Dr George W. Pigman, California Institute of Technology. We are also profoundly grateful to His Excellency Sergio Pagano, Prefect of the Archivio Segreto Vaticano, for his assistance and competence, and to his staff for their generous help with our research (**Docs.** 2, 6, 8, 10, 12, 13, 16, 38); Dr D. José Luis Rodríguez de Diego, Director, Archivo General de Simancas (**Docs.** 3, 5); Dr Pierre-Jacques Lamblin, Directeur de la Bibliothèque municipale de Douai (**Doc.** 17); Trustees of Lambeth Palace Library (**Doc.** 17); the staff of The National Archive, Kew (**Docs.** 19, 20, 22, 42); staff of the British Library (**Doc.** 23); Father Robert Danieluk, SJ, Father José Yoldi, SJ, Mr Mauro Brunello of the Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu (**Docs.** 24, 30, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 39, 40, 44, 45, 46, 47 ); Ms. Iris Jones, archivist of the Venerable English College, Rome; Father James F.X. Pratt, SJ, Dr Nicoletta Basilotta and Mr Stephen Fernando of the Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu (Rome); Brother James Hodgkinson, SJ, Ms. Anna Edwards and Ms. Mihaela Repina of the Archivum Britannicum Societatis Iesu (London) (**Docs.** 31, 32); Monsignor Mark Crisp, Rector of St Mary's College, Oscott; Sutton Coldfield, for his permission to publish the important refutation of "A comfortable advertisement" (**Doc.** 25); and Canon Alan Griffiths for reading and checking Latin translations.

We have tried to use a uniform style throughout the editions, but given that we three come from different academic traditions, there are most likely inconsistencies. Original spelling has been preserved with the exception of the modern usage of *u* and *v*, and *i* and *j*. Most abbreviations have been expanded. Marginal comments have been inserted into the text in *italics*; only deletions and corrections deemed important and significant by the editors, have been included. In Scriptural citations in the footnotes, we have “translated” the Catholic references to contemporary usage. We tried to retain original capitalization, but difficulty distinguishing between majuscule and minuscule in some documents may have resulted in more than usual inconsistency. Regarding dating, unless the documents themselves specify otherwise, we assume that documents written in England and Scotland were dated in the “old style” and those on the continent, “new style.” We understand the year for both, however, as beginning on 1 January and not 25 March.

# Abbreviations

(Additional information can be found in the Bibliography)

a.	answer
ar.	article
ABSI	Archivum Britannicum Societatis Iesu (London)
Add. MS.	Additional Manuscript
AHSI	<i>Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu</i>
ARCR	A.F. Allison and D.M. Rogers, eds., <i>The Contemporary Printed Literature of the English Counter-Reformation between 1558 and 1640</i> . 2 vols. Aldershot, 1989–1994.
ARSI	Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu (Rome)
art.	article
bk	book
BL	British Library (London)
c.	caput
cap.	capitulum
CE	<i>The Catholic Encyclopedia</i> . Eds. Charles G. Herbermann et al. 17 vols. New York, 1907–1914.
cf.	confer
col(s).	column(s)
CRS	Catholic Record Society
CSP Domestic	Robert Lemon et al, eds. <i>Calendar of State Papers, Domestic Series of the Reigns of Edward VI ...</i> . 12 vols. London, 1856–1872.
CSP Foreign	Joseph Stevenson et al, eds. <i>Calendar of State Papers Foreign Series of the Reign of Elizabeth</i> . 23 vols. in 26. London, 1863–1950.
CSP Spanish	Royall Tyler et al, eds. <i>Calendar of State Papers Spanish</i> . 15 vols. in 20. London, 1862–1954.
CSP Rome	J.M. Rigg, ed. <i>Calendar of State Papers relating to English Affairs, preserved principally at Rome</i> . 2 vols. London, 1912–1926.
doc(s).	document(s)
n.d.	no date
n.p.	no place

n.	note
no. (nos.)	number(s)
<i>Oxford DNB</i>	H.C.G. Matthew and Brian Harrison, eds. <i>The Oxford Dictionary of National Biography</i> . 60 vols. Oxford, 2004.
PG	Patrologiae cursus completus, series graeca. Ed. Jacques-Paul Migne. 166 vols. Paris, 1856–1912.
PL	Patrologiae cursus completus, series latina. Ed. Jacques-Paul Migne. 221 vols. Paris, 1844–1906.
q.	<i>quaestio</i> (question)
RSTC	A.W. Pollard and G.R. Redgrave, eds. <i>A Short Title Catalogue of Books Printed in England, Scotland, &amp; Ireland and of English Books Printed Abroad, 1475–1640</i> . 2nd edn. 3 vols. London, 1976–1991.
SP	State Papers
vers.	verses